



Elevated CO₂ indirectly stimulates N₂-fixation via its impact on legume biomass: a Bayesian meta-analysis

Kiona Ogle (1,2), Aimee Classen (3), Kristine Dyrnum (4), Sarah E. Hobbie (5), Tali Lee (6), Anders Michelsen (4), Paul Newton (7), Rich Norby (8), Craig W. Osenberg (9), Anders Priemé (4), Reich Peter (10,11), César Terrer (12), Kees Jan van Groenigen (2,13), and Bruce Hungate (2)

(1) School of Informatics, Computing, and Cyber Systems, Northern Arizona University, Flagstaff, Arizona, USA, (2) Center for Ecosystem Science and Society, Northern Arizona University, Flagstaff, Arizona, USA, (3) Rubenstein School of Environment & Natural Resources, University of Vermont, Burlington, Vermont, USA, (4) Department of Biology, University of Copenhagen, Copenhagen, Denmark, (5) Department of Ecology, Evolution, and Behavior, University of Minnesota, St. Paul, Minnesota, USA, (6) Biology Department, University of Wisconsin, Eau Claire, Wisconsin, USA, (7) AgResearch, Palmerston North, New Zealand, (8) Environmental Sciences Division and Climate Change Science Institute, Oak Ridge National Laboratory, Oak Ridge, Tennessee, USA, (9) Odum School of Ecology, University of Georgia, Athens, Georgia, USA, (10) Department of Forest Resources, University of Minnesota, St. Paul, Minnesota, USA, (11) Hawkesbury Institute for the Environment, Western Sydney University, Penrith, New South Wales, Australia, (12) Institut de Ciència i Tecnologia Ambientals, Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona, Barcelona, Spain, (13) College of Life and Environmental Sciences, University of Exeter, Exeter, Devon, UK

The impact of rising atmospheric CO₂ on terrestrial carbon (C) accumulation depends in part on nitrogen (N) availability, an important source of which is biological N₂-fixation. Higher rates of N₂-fixation with rising CO₂ could provide the necessary N for maintaining the future land C sink. Yet, experimental results show mixed support for this hypothesis. We extracted data from 77 studies reporting experimental results of the effect of elevated CO₂ (eCO₂) on N₂-fixation. For all (468) records, we extracted the mean N₂-fixation rate for the control and eCO₂ treatments, and, when available, the corresponding standard deviation (SD). We also extracted information on other factors that might influence the response to eCO₂, including non-symbiotic vs symbiotic associations, inside vs outside experiments, monocultures vs mixed communities, phosphorus added vs not, intact vs disturbed soil, and the reported biomass (mean and SD) of N₂-fixing plants. For each record, we computed the log response ratio (LRR) and its corresponding SD, for both N₂-fixation and plant biomass. To accommodate the complexity of the compiled data, and to estimate key quantities of interest, we conducted a hierarchical Bayesian meta-analysis of the LRR data. The LRRs and SDs for N₂-fixation and plant biomass were simultaneously analyzed, allowing us to impute missing biomass LRRs, and to model N₂-fixation LRR as a function of the corresponding biomass LRR (observed or imputed), important experimental factors, and within and among study random effects. We estimated the global LRR of N₂-fixation across all studies and experimental factors, and for five scenarios describing a gradient from “most natural” (i.e., outside, intact soil, mixed community, no P addition) to “most artificial” (inside, disturbed soil, P added). The Bayesian model revealed that the N₂-fixation response was governed by the biomass response; eCO₂ generally stimulated production of N₂-fixing plants, which in turn lead to higher rates of N₂-fixation under eCO₂. Both plant biomass and N₂-fixation were most strongly stimulated by eCO₂ under more artificial conditions, and neither were significantly affected by eCO₂ under more natural settings. However, the N₂-fixation and plant biomass responses to eCO₂ were most strongly coupled under the most natural (undisturbed, outside) and most artificial (inside) settings, whereas they were only weakly coupled under disturbed, outside conditions. Additionally, non-symbiotic N₂-fixation generally did not respond to eCO₂, whereas there was a clear trend for symbiotic N₂-fixation to respond positively to eCO₂, but again, only under artificial conditions. In summary, the Bayesian meta-analysis (1) provided little support for direct effects of eCO₂ on N₂-fixation, and instead indicated an indirect response mediate through the direct effects of eCO₂ on biomass production of N₂-fixing plants, and (2) showed that neither N₂-fixation nor plant biomass responded to eCO₂ in natural, intact ecosystems; it was only under more artificial conditions that eCO₂ led to increased plant biomass and N₂-fixation. These results argue against the hypothesis that rising CO₂ will stimulate N₂-fixation in terrestrial ecosystems, and caution against building that expectation into models of the future land C sink.